CONTINUING PROFESSIONAL DEVELOPMENT FOR VOCATIONAL TEACHERS AND TRAINERS IN KOSOVO

CONTINUING PROFESSIONAL DEVELOPMENT FOR VOCATIONAL TEACHERS AND TRAINERS IN KOSOVO

PREPARED BY PROF. DR RAME LIKAJ FOR THE ETF

March 2016

ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS

---

[1] This designation is without prejudice to positions on status, and is in line with UNSCR 1244 and the ICJ Opinion on the Kosovo Declaration of Independence.

Contents

See the ANNEXES on the ETF's Continuing Professional Development Platform: **goo.gl/4KydhO**

Annex A. Literature review

Annex B. Survey results

Annex C. Recommendations from the Ministry of Education, Science and Technology's Teacher Training Division

1. RATIONALE

Professional development for teachers and trainers is widely recognised as a vital tool for educational reform. Research demonstrates that professional development can improve the quality of teaching and learning in a sustainable manner, increasing the effectiveness of education and training and adding value for learners, teachers and employers. The importance of continuing professional development (CPD) for vocational education and training (VET) teachers is not in question; Kosovo has, for many years, developed extensive policies to address this issue and current policies are being implemented.

However, improving the quality and quantity of CPD is not easy. To assist policy makers it is vital that policy making, implementation and impact should be reviewed and understood – so that feedback and policy learning occurs. Therefore, this study is concerned about:

■ setting out current policy objectives with respect to improving CPD for VET teachers and trainers;

■ describing the provision of CPD for VET teachers and trainers and the way in which teachers' needs are assessed and particular programmes are assigned to teachers;

■ understanding how the arrangements for CPD fit with other parts of the VET system;

■ evaluating how well current arrangements are working; and

■ making recommendations about how current policies can be implemented and how the provision and allocation of CPD can be improved.

It is intended that this study will bring forward evidence to inform discussion, that it will inform thinking and action at many levels of decision making and that it will stimulate new enquiries and new proposals.

2. METHODOLOGY

The methodology contained four elements: a workshop in Belgrade in March 2015; a literature review; interviews with key stakeholders; and a survey of teachers.

Belgrade workshop

Key stakeholders from Kosovo were invited to discuss CPD needs and provision at a regional meeting in Belgrade. Stakeholders reviewed ETF proposals and agreed about the framework for a joint action to improve CPD in the South Eastern European and Turkey region:

- mapping of provision,

- network for policy makers and demonstration projects, and

- support to the implementation of ETF project for CPD in the country.

All stakeholders committed themselves to support the project and to provide necessary inputs for the successful implementation of the research. Regarding draft questions for quality interviews and the draft questionnaire for VET teachers, the country team agreed to provide support for access to VET institutions and facilitate the job of national experts for interviews and data collection as well as dissemination of the results. The content of questionnaires was validated by stakeholders who helped to identify policy priorities.

Research goals

- To characterise the current state of policy development and implementation with respect to CPD for VET teachers and trainers.

- To characterise provision and demand by country.

- To compare provision and demand and to assess the match between demand and supply.

- To compare provision and demand between countries and, if possible, against international benchmarks.

In accordance with these goals, the methodology included:

- desk review of documents and published research on the current state of CPD of VET teachers and trainers;

- interviews with 17 stakeholders responsible for policy, provision and implementation of CPD activities of VET teachers; and

- survey of VET teachers employed at 12 VET schools or training centres.

Interviews

The interviews took place between 1st and 28th May. They were carried out with relevant stakeholders, identified together with the country team during the three-day conference in Belgrade. Interviewees included:

- head of VET Division,

- officer from Teacher Training Division,

- VET expert at Kosovo Pedagogical Institute,

- school principals,

- director of Municipal Education Directorate – Peja,

- regional VET inspector – Ferizaj,

- director of VET Department of the Centre of Competence,

- member of State Council for Teacher Licensing,

- quality insurance officer – National Qualification Authority (NQA), and

- school teacher.

The questionnaires were distributed in electronic version to the identified stakeholder for the interviews after prior discussions and explanations given to them about the project and the survey. In total 10 interviews were carried out.

Literature review

The literature review identified documents which deal with CPD for general and VET teachers in Kosovo. These documents include policy papers starting from legislation (laws and administrative instructions), different reports of relevant institutions, research papers, survey reports and analysis, reports from different projects, statistical data from EMIS and ASK and, most importantly for Kosovo's progress reports 2011–14, Kosovo Education Strategic Plan 2011–2016. The literature review revealed a lack of data and research on this topic (see Annex A).

The survey

A survey of VET teachers was conducted in Kosovo to assess their experience of CPD. A list of all 63 VET schools (covering all seven regions of Kosovo and different VET providers of different status – public and private VET schools and centres of competences) was submitted to the ETF and from this list the ETF CPD project leader randomly identified the intended sample of 12 VET schools. Readiness to cooperate in this project was expressed by eight VET schools out of twelve – two technical schools, two economic schools, three professional schools and one centre of competence. The questionnaires were distributed either as hard copy or as online web-based questionnaires – depending on preference. The survey was conducted from 18 May to 1 June 2015.

The responses were approximately 250, which represents some 9.3% of total population from 2 700 VET teachers. Of these responses, 116 were paper-based and the rest were online. One problem that has been identified is that even though the questionnaire was designed to be completed easily and very simple to understand some of the VET teachers didn't complete the entire questionnaire. About 49.2% of respondents are female and 87.8% are VET teachers, while practical work coordinators or instructors are declared around 8.3% and only 0.4% are pedagogical advisors. The employment status of respondents is as follows: around 80% are full time employed while only around 6% are part time employed (less than 50% of time). In terms of age, 12.8% respondents are up to 30 years old; 53.2% are 30–50 years old; and 34% are over 50 years old.

3. POLICY DEVELOPMENT IN RELATION TO CONTINUING PROFESSIONAL DEVELOPMENT

3.1 Kosovo Education Strategic Planning

The legal framework for general education consists of laws, administrative instructions and national strategies.

Laws

- Law on Pre-School Education,

- Law on Pre-University Education,

- Law on VET,

- Law on National Qualification,

- Law on Education in the Municipalities of Kosovo.

Administrative instructions

- Administrative Instruction 5/2015 for Teachers Normative,

- Administrative Instruction 25/2014 for Teachers Licensing,

- Administrative Instruction 14/2013 Teacher Performance Evaluation,

- Administrative Instruction 15/2013 for Funding of Teacher Professional Development,

- Administrative Instruction 15/2013 for Implementation of Teacher Professional Development,

- Administrative Instruction 04/2010 on Criteria and Procedures for Accreditation of Programmes for Teacher Professional Development.

The overall objective of the Kosovo Education Strategic Plan 2011–2016 in the sub-sector of teacher development was to put in place an effective and sustainable teacher development system, to improve quality of education. For this strategic goal the sub-sector for teacher development had the following priorities to make teacher licensing fully operational:

- create supporting mechanisms for teachers that will help them to achieve the standards;

- support teachers to successfully implement the new Kosovo Curriculum Framework;

- improve the pre-service and in-service teacher development and training provision;

- continue quality and gender-sensitive curriculum development and implementation;

- help municipalities and schools coordinate efforts and organise teacher training programmes in municipalities.

On 3 June 2015 the Prime Minister and the Office for Strategic Planning of Government of Kosovo started to introduce the process of development of the National Development Strategy 2016–2021.

The plan addresses four themes under the heading of 'Human capital and social cohesion':

- investing in the future;

- skills for work in the 21st century;

- mobilizing the Diaspora for development; and

- inclusive education.

Proposed measures for investing in the future are:

■ increasing enrolment in pre-school education;

■ establishing an operational system for teachers' licensing;

■ proper mechanisms for quality assurance at central, local and school levels; and

■ promoting ICT usage in teaching.

Proposed measures for skills for work in the 21st century are:

■ achieving structural quality in VET and higher education;

■ revision of VET and higher education curricula; and

■ smart specializations and linkages with industry sector.

Whereas proposed measures for inclusive education are:

■ encouraging business activities for women and ethnic minorities; and

■ programme 'Kindergarden for all'.

Regarding measures for the teacher licensing system, the results to be obtained are:

■ establishing a teacher payment system based on licenses;

■ 2% of teachers to be promoted Emeritus;

■ 10% to be promoted in Mentor teachers;

■ 20% to be promoted in advanced teacher;

■ 35% to be promoted to regular teachers; and

■ 500 teachers to be involved in retraining programmes.

It is anticipated that these plans will be validated and endorsed by the Government at the latest by November 2015; and they will influence the development of the human capital sector, including the education sector and the teacher licensing system. Detailed recommendations with respect to CPD, such as quality assurance and support for teachers, will be made by a working group established by the Ministry of Education, Science and Technology (MEST).

3.2   Implementation of policy for licensing

Most teachers in secondary education (54%) are unqualified. Almost all studies confirm that the quality of education and teachers' performance is the most important factor to improve students' achievements.

Most VET teachers in Kosovo have no teaching qualification. It is generally accepted that most VET teachers lack pedagogical training, subject-specific practical training for VET, and training related to specific requirements for competency-based curriculum implementation. This situation is made even more difficult due to the limited budget for the CPD of teachers at the municipal level.

In 2009, MEST launched the teacher licensing system as one of the priorities of the Kosovo Education Strategic Plan 2011–2016. In Kosovo 22 315 teachers of all kinds are licensed; in 2014 a further 4 500 were registered. Inspection centres in all seven regions are trained to enter and manage the database programme for the teacher licensing system.

The State Council for Teacher Licensing has developed a professional development and performance evaluation mechanism that will provide teachers with an opportunity to strengthen their qualifications

and move up the career ladder. Acting on recommendation from the State Council for Teacher Licensing, MEST has established criteria and standards of preparation and professional qualification that a teacher must meet to obtain a licence. MEST established a licensing system to encourage unqualified teachers to qualify and for qualified and licensed teachers to increase competencies and qualifications. Based on Administrative Instruction 09/2014, all teachers, including VET teachers younger than 51 years old are obliged to undertake in-service CPD.

The system, which is already in place, can grant either temporary or regular licences to teachers. The MEST Teacher Training Division plans CPD continuously for all VET teachers, based on the requests from VET schools. Since 2011 MEST has developed a CPD catalogue with a list of teacher training providers and programmes.

During 2014 seven non-governmental organisations (NGOs) were accredited, and 17 new in-service teacher training programmes and 10 teacher training programmes of USAID/BEP were re-accredited. The total number of all kinds of accredited teacher training programmes is 31. The total number of certified trainers is around 723. The monitoring and assessment of CPD impact on teacher's performance remains a major challenge. However, teacher training programmes for maths and natural sciences were monitored and assessed by GIZ in 2014.

3.3   Development of capacity for CPD

In order to provide cost effective professional development, CPD centres were established in 23 municipalities by the Kosovo Education Centre in 2013. Teacher training programmes have been developed and each partner municipality has developed a three-year plan for CPD. Each school in partner municipality has nominated at least two members who have been trained to prepare a teacher training plan for CPD.

However, completing professional development plans for schools remains a challenge. Only a negligible percentage of schools have teacher development plans in place. In order to advance the process, MEST has supported the establishment of 1 150 professional teams in schools. Some 720 facilitators, trainers, mentors and evaluators were included in the training process. Members of school boards, including teachers, parents and school directors were also part of the training[2].

MEST in cooperation with the Faculty of Education of the University of Prishtina has supported a programme leading to the advancement of teachers' qualification, which serves to extend two- and three-year qualifications originating at a higher pedagogical school to a four-year bachelor's degree.

3.4   Initial teacher education

In July 2015 MEST issued a new Administrative Instruction 05/2015 normative for VET teachers. The main purpose of this administrative instruction is to select and recruit VET teaching staff for theory and practice modules for all profiles of VET schools. This puts a lot pressure on teaching staff and the system to meet new requirements, since the only Kosovo Accreditation Agency or accredited higher education institution to qualify teachers is the Education Faculty of University of Prishtina. To date seven master's degree programmes have been accredited but only one is for VET teachers, with a limited number of training places.

---

[2] MEST, Joint Annual Review 2014 of Kosovo Education Strategic Plan 2011–2016

3.5   Conclusions

Teachers' CPD policy is an integral part of the Kosovo Education Policy and this is confirmed by strategic documents. However the implementation is an issue, not only because of resources but also because of a lack of understanding that VET teachers should be recognized as a category of teachers with specific CPD needs and that the provision of CPD for VET teachers should have distinctive features in order to meet those needs. The same considerations apply to VET teachers' initial education and to legal norms defining requirements for VET teachers.

3.6   Issues and recommendations

Main issues	Recommendations
■ Bridging the gap between policies and their implementation ■ Little commitment of key stakeholders for development and implementation of new policies and strategies	■ Increase commitment of key stakeholders through engagement in next Kosovo Education Strategic Plan ■ Strengthen partnership between MEST, municipal education directorates and VET schools with regard to CPD
■ Limited resources of municipalities for the implementation of licensing, CPD and performance evaluation ■ Limited capacity at school level for planning, needs analysis and evaluation	■ Develop municipal education directorates' capacities to implement, including funding, coordination of teacher training providers, evaluation and planning ■ Appoint school coordinators for CPD and inclusion of all VET schools in this process ■ Encourage peer coaching for CPD ■ Capacity building for developing teacher training plan for CPD ■ Establish procedures and a system for teacher induction
■ Better quality assurance for CPD programmes and evaluation	■ Certification of all VET teachers (participants) and attached credits to teacher training programmes based on type (training content and duration) ■ Develop a proper licensing database to record individual teachers and their progress in the licensing system
■ Lack of reliable and accessible data on teacher needs and competence development	Teacher training information management system is needed in order to: ■ track teacher progress towards meeting licensing requirements ■ inform policy evaluation and review ■ understand individual teacher needs and identify priorities for professional development needs

4. ORGANISATIONS AND INSTITUTIONS

4.1 Ministry of Education, Science and Technology, municipal education directorates and VET schools

MEST has made professional development of teachers a priority for two reasons:

■ the need to ensure that the teaching methodologies in schools are up to date and effective, as well as the need to support teachers for the implementation of the new school curriculum in Kosovo;

■ professional development is considered critical for the implementation of a teacher licensing system – a key strategy to improve the quality of education provision.

MEST Teacher Training Division organises its own in-service training programmes and cooperates with local and international NGOs to provide CPD to address new teaching and learning methodologies and also to support the implementation of new curricula. All proposed CPD must be approved by MEST before being offered to teachers and other school staff.

Organisations that offer CPD must be accredited by MEST and the State Council for Teacher Licensing. There is a special system to accredit and quality assure CPD programmes and delivery to ensure that they meet the needs of VET schools and teachers; are in line with curriculum requirements; and follow changes in technology. However, this system is not fully implemented because of limitations in budget and human resources.

Until now various trainings have been organised for VET teachers by GTZ (GIZ), Swisscontact, EU Kosvet, Danida, Lux Development, National Qualification Authority, etc. The following kinds of CPD have been offered to VET teachers:

■ provision of subject-specific practical training for VET teachers;

■ methods of professional practice;

■ education management and leadership;

■ career education;

■ pedagogical training; and

■ training for competency-based curriculum implementation.

The responsibilities between MEST, municipal education directorates, VET schools and CPD providers are shared as indicated below.

■ VET schools plan teacher training needs on an annual basis and decide which teachers should participate in which programmes.

■ MEST approves or reject plans and selects teacher training providers.

■ MEST provides access of VET teachers to CPD programmes.

■ The municipal education directorates are responsible for coordinating teacher training providers regarding teacher training implementation.

The Law on Education in the Municipalities states that MEST is responsible for establishing and managing a general system of certification for all teachers in Kosovo. The municipalities, on the other

hand, are in charge of supervision and inspection of the education process in accordance with guidelines established by MEST.

According to the Law on Inspection of Education, school inspections are to be arranged in an annual cycle, with the possibility of special inspections under certain conditions established by the Inspection Department[3]. Inspectors help to monitor CPD as part of the licensing system: in 2014, seven inspectors from regional offices were trained to transfer training data onto the training database.

However, current school inspections are mainly limited to ensuring compliance with laws, bylaws and administrative requirements in the context of school processes rather than evaluating the quality of teaching and learning. According to the Joint Annual Review of Kosovo Education Strategic Plan's Implementation (2013 and 2014)[4] school inspectors and middle management have limited experience of observing, monitoring and supporting teaching and learning in the classroom. The lack of advisory structures that would assist teachers and schools in improving their performance as well as insufficient progress in exercising the advisory role of the municipal education directorates were also mentioned as factors contributing to this problem[5].

MEST (including the VET Division), NGOs, VET schools, municipal education directorates and the Faculty of Education are in continuous consultations for selection of CPD programmes. The responses from interviews suggest that these consultations are sometimes not effective since stakeholders do not have a shared understanding of CPD or of VET teachers' needs.

4.2   Kosovo Pedagogical Institute (KPI)

The KPI is a public scientific institution dealing with research, training, evaluations and innovation in the field of education. Its mission is to provide professional services to MEST and educational institutions at all levels in Kosovo. Its main tasks are:

■ to conduct research, analyse and compare educational achievements of Kosovo to other countries;

■ to develop research activities in the areas of educational standards, curriculum, textbooks, assessment, training of teachers and administrators of educational institutions;

■ to provide training in the areas of curricula, educational standards, textbooks, assessment, training of teachers and administrators of educational institutions;

■ to provide support to MEST and to the municipal education directorates in the development of educational policies and reforms in education; and

■ to prepare, present and publish the results of research, special publications, teaching materials and manuals for teachers and heads of educational institutions.

Until now the KPI's role for CPD has been very limited except for some research activities carried out to evaluate the influence of specific CPD programmes. The KPI was involved in a joint activity with MEST to monitor the implementation of CPD programmes for the Kosovo Curriculum Framework.

---

3 MEST, Law on Inspection, 37/2004

4 MEST, Aide-mémoire from Joint Annual Review 2013, 2014 of Kosovo Education Strategic Plan 2011–2016

5 Anastasovska-Jankulovska, M., Teacher Education and Training in the Western Balkans, 2013

4.3 National Qualification Authority (NQA)

The NQA is reponsible for establishing and maintaining the national qualifications framework[6]; it has a significant role in any overall quality system for VET. Moreover, the NQA, together with MEST and the Kosovo Accreditation Agency, is responsible for regulating the award of qualifications, and for accrediting providers and institutions to assess and award qualifications. The NQA also has the responsibility of accrediting providers to deliver training as well as to assess and award. The NQA, therefore, also plays a major role in terms of quality assurance of VET in Kosovo. It is fully operational in terms of verifying the occupation standards (50 occupation standards have been developed and verified until now), validation of the qualifications at levels 2, 3 and 4 of the national qualifications framework, as well as the accreditation of 36 providers in mechanical engineering, automotive engineering, welding, ICT, foreign languages, business administration, etc. The quality of these qualifications is in line with European standards and these qualifications meet the needs of society and the labour market in Kosovo[7].

The NQA has very good cooperation with its partners: MEST, Ministry of Labour and Social Welfare, Ministry of Trade and Industry, public and private providers, OEK, Kosovo Business Alliance, British Council Kosovo, Kosovo Accreditation Agency, etc. Even though the NQA's staff resources are limited with only six permanent staff, until now they have been very active in supporting around 80 institutions to prepare self assessment reports and improvement plans, providing training to quality assurance coordinators, school and training centre managers in the field of assessment, self-assessment, external evaluation and mentoring. Until now the NQA has provided several training modules for VET teachers, VET school coordinators, VET school managers and officials from municipal education directorates and MEST. These trainings covered mostly topics such as assessment, self-assessment, mentoring, school management, validation, accreditation and certification; until now more than 750 training places have been offered.

4.4 Agency for Vocational Education and Training and Adult Education (AVETAE)

AVETAE was founded by MEST by Administrative Instruction 14/2014. Its main activities are planning, development, organisation, implementation, overviewing and improvement of the professional education and adult education system to support economic development of the country and employability. The agency's goals are to:

■ develop competency based qualifications, with defined learning outcomes that meet the needs of labour market;

■ develop a VET system with a lifelong learning perspective;

■ define the role of teachers oriented to the results of learning; and

■ create a system which ensures quality.

Until now AVETAE has been operating in a pilot phase and their contribution regarding CPD has focused on Training in Methodics and Didactics and Professional Didactics with around 189 VET teachers trained.

---

[6] MEST, 2008 Law No 03/L-060
[7] NQA, 2013, 2014 Annual report

4.5   Faculty of Education

The University of Pristina is going through a process of transforming its teacher education programmes. In Kosovo based on the Law on Higher Education[8] teacher qualification programmes are offered only by public providers and must be accredited by the Kosovo Accreditation Agency. The Faculty of Education is the only institution accredited by the Kosovo Accreditation Agency to prepare pre-service and in-service teachers and remains a purely educational faculty focusing on professional, practical and pedagogical work.

The Faculty of Education of the University of Prishtina, in cooperation with MEST, has supported the Programme for Advancement of Teachers for teachers that have graduated from two or three year Higher Pedagogical School programmes to give them a qualification equivalent to a four-year bachelor's degree. Until now around 4 296 teachers have been included in this programme.

The newly established R&D Centre of the Faculty of Education is responsible for continuing professional development of teachers and education research. The centre provides support for professional development of teachers to prepare, accredit and deliver in-service teacher training programmes for VET teachers. This centre might help to research the needs and help to design appropriate CPD in Kosovo. However, it has only one employed staff member; the capacities of the centre should be developed and strengthened.

Eight new master programmes are being developed by an EU Tempus project, including also a master for VET teachers.

4.6   The Association for Vocational Education and Training (AMAAP)

AMAAP was a non-profit organisation and an NGO, registered in 2010. Its members were registered VET teachers and trainers. AMAAP was specialised in several fields of education such as good teaching, management of education institutions and processes, curriculum development, training needs analyses, and CPD for teachers and school managers. Its main purpose was to support the economic development of Kosovo through active measures in VET which are planned in education reform. In the past, the organisation provided training for teachers and educational leaders and research.

AMAAP was licensed by MEST with support of GIZ to provide the following CPD programmes:

■   professional didactics, basic programme;

■   methodic-didactic, basic programme; and

■   education leadership, basic programme.

However, the organisation has ceased to exist and no longer provides training.

4.7   Conclusions

There are permanent public organisations with regulatory roles with respect to the provision of CPD for VET teachers. However, there are relatively few organisations with capacity and experience of providing specialised CPD for VET teachers. Provision by the MEST Teacher Training Division has focused on general teacher competences, for the most part. CPD targeted at VET teachers has been delivered by NGOs supported by donors regulated by MEST. Furthermore, there are issues about the

---

[8] Law on Higher Education No 04/L-037, Article 16, point 5: 'Only the public providers of higher education could offer study programmes which lead to the qualification of the teachers to be employed in a school.'

functions and capacities of organisations to jointly identify, plan, deliver and evaluate CPD. To date, AVETAE is not established as a provider of CPD for VET teachers and the University of Prishtina is still building capacity for provision, design and research of CPD.

Partly as a result of these factors, CPD for VET teachers is insufficient in volume and not well matched to teachers' needs. The CPD catalogue has not been updated since 2011. In general, there is a need to develop organisational capacity for specialised CPD provision which is guided by knowledge of VET teachers' needs and is appropriately evaluated. There is a need to review the licensing system which, currently, does not serve the VET system well.

4.8   Issues and recommendations

Main issues	Recommendations
■ The Faculty of Education is the only higher education institution accredited to qualify teachers for pre-university education.	■ Further support to Faculty of Education for provision and extension of provision of master programmes for VET teachers to meet the requirements of VET teachers normative 05/2015, since their provision capacities are very low in comparison with needs.
■ The Faculty of Education does not have capacity to provide sufficient training to permit VET teachers to meet the requirements for qualification as specified in the licensing arrangements.	■ Further enhance the capacities of the Faculty of Education for curricula, teaching staff and research through the Institute for Teacher Development. ■ Review the licensing system with respect to VET teachers.
■ School inspectors and school management have limited experience in observing, monitoring and supporting teaching and learning in the classroom.	■ Provide capacity building for education inspectors and school principals for observing, monitoring and supporting teaching and learning in the classroom.
■ The teacher training catalogue is outdated.	■ MEST Teacher Training Division should keep, publish and update catalogue of programmes for CPD on an annual basis and data on CPD programmes and accredited providers.
■ The impact of CPD is not understood.	■ The Pedagogical Institute needs to plan more research activities and classroom observations for checking if CPD practices are resulting in positive changes in the classroom.
■ CPD for VET teachers should be responsive to the training needs of VET teachers.	■ AVETAE should play a role in the design and implementation of CPD programmes for VET teachers and instructors and advise MEST in revising policies for VET teacher licensing.
	■ VET teacher's associations need to be established and play an active role in CPD, for example, to help identifying needs and shape programmes.

5. VOLUME, MODE AND CHARACTER OF CPD PROVISION BY PROVIDERS OTHER THAN VOCATIONAL SCHOOLS

During 2011–15, 32 capacity-building workshops took place in 30 municipalities with 92 schools to implement the Kosovo Curriculum Framework. Of these, 10 were VET schools.

The training programmes which are currently offered by accredited training providers for in-service VET teachers are professional didactics, and methodics and didactics. The duration of these training programmes is five working days (or 40 teacher training hours). During the 2013/14 school year MEST and its development partners trained 105 VET teachers and for 2014/15 the plan was to train 410 VET teachers (approximately 15% of the total) through programmes delivered in VET schools, didactic centres or training centres for VET. 'Reading and writing for critical thinking' (RWCT), 'Step by Step', 'Social justice and education for children's rights' have taken a central role both in terms of quantity (programmes of 5–15 training days) and quality. Provision is available during the whole year and usually takes place during the weekends or the holidays.

The following table provides the list of accredited providers based on the 2011 catalogue[9].

CPD provider	CPD accredited programmes	Total number of training hours	Number of teachers who benefited 2010–15
AMAAP	Professional didactics, basic programme	40	2 500 VET teachers
	Methodic-didactic, basic programme	40	
	Education leadership, basic programme	180	
Down Syndrome Kosova	Early intervention and education for SNE	16 & 24	
Education for all	Human rights and peer learning	64 & 80	2/3 of VET schools covered and 1/3 of VET teachers
FSDEK I&II	CPD for inclusive education (60 ECTS)	1 600 hours, one-year duration	
GIZ	Professional didactics, basic programme	40	
	Methodic-didactic, basic programme	40	
	Education leadership, basic programme	180	
	Career education	120	
Council of Europe	Education for democratic citizenship and education for human rights	25	
College Universum	CPD, basic programme (tri programmes for pre-school, elementary education and upper secondary)	90	
	Management and leadership	15	
KEK TC	Technical trainings (electrotechnics, mechanics and welding)	60 up to 120	
	Non technical trainings (IT, management)	16–24	
	Job safety	6–18	
ECLO project	Teaching and multiculturalism	350	
	Access to quality education for Roma, Ashkali and Egyptian people	102	

---

[9] This list is based on the 2011 teacher training catalogue. Although a lot of developments and changes have taken place in the meantime, the list has not been updated by the MEST Teacher Training Division.

EU IT pilot project	IT basics and e-learning	20	
ICRC	HDN	24	
Kosovo Health Foundation	Drug prevention	32	
KulturKontakt	New teaching and learning strategies	32	
Kosovo Education Centre	Critical thinking, reading and writing	16–144 training hours based on type of programme	34 accredited teacher training programmes
	New teaching and learning strategies		
	Strategies for building critical thinkers		
	Logframe method		
	School development plan		
	Planning for school projects		
	Quality education programme		
	Governance and leadership, etc.		
QPEA	Support to children with learning difficulties	16	
	Education for the risk of mines and other explosives through school-based programme	72	
	Mental health protection	24	
	Children rights and freedoms	16	
REC Kosova	Green package	8	
RTM & CIPOF	Majeutica	16	
Union of Teachers	ECDL (seven modules)	88	12 000 teachers
KAHCR	Education for children rights and freedoms	32 + 32	
AVETAE	Training in methodics and didactics	100	
	Training professional didactics	89	
DANIDA	Teachers trained in how to use lab equipment	45	
	Coordinators trained in how to use new technologies	8	
	Teachers in agribusiness in cooperation with Swisscontact related to approach and methodology of virtual firms	13	
	ECDL course (modules 1, 2 and 5)	13	
	Entrepreneurship	12	
	Training for paring with contemporary methods of pruning various types of tree and grape vine, production and use of organic fertilizers in agricultural products	80	
	Training in using of new technologies in the production of ornamental plants in greenhouses and open fields	77	
	Training in using of learning materials	70	
	Training for production and use of compost	78	
	Training for the use of agricultural mechanization for four schools	45	
	Training for the design of school development plans	24	
KOSVET	CPD for in-service VET teachers and trainers		320 teachers and 40 master trainers
MEST and Kosovo Pedagogical Institute	Methodical and practical aspects for planning and implementation of new curriculum		210 certified teachers and 25 VET schools involved
	Teaching methodology, teaching materials and evaluation of students' attitude		
	Training based on areas of curriculum		
Lux Development KSV/015 project	Training in methodic and didactics		52 teachers
	Training professional didactics		52 teachers
	ECDL		26 teachers
	Training related to occupations		18 teachers
	Practice firms		6 teachers

According to the survey, 84% of teachers in Kosovo reported that they had completed an initial education that prepared them to become a teacher. However, based on the findings from the interviews and reports of the MEST Teacher Training Division it appears that 54% of teachers working in upper secondary education are either unqualified or have not completed any pedagogical or educational studies.

Despite having gained a qualification, 37% of teachers reported that their training did not contain content relevant to all or some of the subjects they are teaching and 50% reported they had not received pedagogical training for all or some of the subjects that they were teaching. 15.7% had received no classroom practice as part of their training, while 26.7% reported that they had received practice only for some subjects. The Progress Report on Kosovo Education Strategic Plan 2011–2016 confirms that a large proportion of VET teachers lack pedagogical training.

Regarding their employment status, 35% of respondents have fixed-term contracts for more than one school year and 18.1% of them have fixed-term contract for a period of one school year or less: less than half of VET teachers have permanent contracts. Fixed-term contracts may be evidence that teachers are unqualified for the topic they teach or that they are young and don't meet the criteria of the normative for VET teachers and the criteria of the teacher licensing system.

According to the survey of VET teachers:

■ 57.4% of teachers reported that they had no organised in-service teacher training provided out of school over the last 12 months.

■ 26% had more than 30 hours of training.

■ 16.6% had from 2 to 30 training hours, which is equal with minimum criteria for holding a temporary licence.

Regarding in-service teacher training provided in-school over the last 12 months the results of the survey are as follows:

■ 59.7% of teachers reported no organised in-school in-service teacher training.

■ 24.5% have answered that they had more than 30 hours of training.

■ 15.9% had from 2 to 30 training hours.

The survey confirms that most VET teachers do not receive CPD that has a VET focus. 64.3% reported that did not have any hours of professional development with a focus on the vocational specialism that they teach and only 15.6% had from 2 to 30 training hours.

In conclusion, only 26% of VET teachers surveyed reported that they had more than 30 hours of organised CPD out of school in the last 12 months which raises concerns as to whether the goals of the Kosovo Education Strategic Plan can be achieved and in particular, whether the licensing requirements can be met.

Around two thirds of VET teachers reported that they did not participate in educational conferences or seminars. When analysed by age and by length of working career there was some evidence that younger teachers are more likely to participate in conferences and research, which can be interpreted as a positive trend.

According to the survey older teachers are less likely to participate in CPD.

■ 63.3% of teachers under 30 had zero hour of CPD and 20.0% had 2–30 hours.

■ 70.6% of 30–50-year-olds and 78.9% of over 50-year-olds had zero hours of CPD.

The survey shows that VET teachers from the Prishtina region have benefited from more hours of CPD than teachers working in other regions.

Analysis suggests that those teachers with the shortest experience as teachers are more likely to access CPD: 59% of teachers with five or less years of experience had no CPD compared to 76.5% of those with 6 to 15 years of experience (but 73% of those with 16 years or more experience).

Less than 15% of VET teachers in Kosovo participated in CPD, visits or observations that took place on business premises. Older and longer serving teachers were slightly more likely to benefit from CPD on business premises – but only to a small degree. However, a large percentage of VET teachers (81%) reported that they had more than three years of work experience in the profession or industry corresponding to the subject that they were teaching. If so this represents a valuable fund of experience that may be exploited to strengthen relationships with the world of work.

The survey shows that 17.8% of respondents have attended part time university programmes. The University of Prishtina has started to offer a part-time master programme in order to address the new requirement that all VET teachers should hold a Master's qualification. Considering the fact that the master programme for VET teachers – starting in October 2015 – offers limited training places (20–40 training places), it may be supposed that licensing of VET teachers will be a long process (with current capacity it will take approximately 30 years). According to the survey, 57% of VET teachers reported that they had undertaken research on a topic of interest; this may represent an opportunity to build a larger role for research within teaching.

Most professional development lasts one or two days; 73% of VET teachers reported that professional development sometimes or often takes the form of events lasting less than one to two days. Shorter or longer events were less common: less than one day (17.2%) or three days or longer (15.2%).

In Kosovo, CPD usually included colleagues from their schools (over 80% of participants) while for over 70% of participants it included opportunities for active learning methods and new technologies. This suggests that the CPD which is offered does, usually, use modern methods.

5.1   Conclusions

In the past there has been a considerable volume of CPD provided to vocational teachers with a focus on didactics and methodology. The main concern currently is that 57.4% of VET teachers reported that they had no organised in-service teacher training provided out of school over the last 12 months and around 60% that they had no school-based CPD during the same period. When it comes to vocationally specific CPD or CPD on business premises there was even less provision. Overall there is insufficient provision – and there are further issues about the distribution and the type of CPD provided.

A relatively high proportion of teachers are engaged in part-time qualifications but provision of part-time master programmes is currently very limited. Most CPD provision takes the form of one- or two-day programmes and there is evidence that modern methods of CPD, e.g. ICT and active learning are established.

There is little opportunity for VET teachers in Kosovo to be supported in their professional development by industrial sectors. This is unfortunate because their initial teacher education does not link closely to industry. More needs to be done to engage business in CPD. The business community needs to be more active in playing its role through active participation in different bodies as foreseen by the education legislation, in this way making VET reforms more efficient, demand driven and a driver for economic development and growth. Most VET teachers have more than three years of relevant industrial experience but it needs to be updated.

5.2   Issues and recommendations

Main issues	Recommendations
■ Most of VET teachers do not benefit from a formal initial pedagogical or methodological training.	■ Further capacity development for CPD provision and drafting of school plans for CPD. ■ Review process by which CPD is allocated to schools and teachers to ensure that resources are well used and that CPD is effective.
■ VET teaching in Kosovo remains too much based on theory. ■ Most VET teachers lack the opportunity to learn from or participate in research. ■ Very few teacher benefit from CPD designed to update their knowledge of workplace skills.	■ CPD programme for VET teachers should be tailored to the real needs identified and should focus more on improving teaching of VET subjects. ■ CPD should promote more active and practical teaching and learning. ■ CPD should engage business more.

6. DESIGN, CAPABILITY AND QUALITY OF CPD PROVISION AND PROGRAMMES

The responsibility for the design of CPD programmes belongs to CPD providers but programmes and providers must be accredited and formally recognised by MEST. In general CPD programmes should be designed to meet the needs of VET teachers, schools, employers, national priorities, curricula and national priorities. During the period 2011–14, 147 CPD programmes have been accredited based on requirements of the Kosovo Curriculum Framework and around 810 VET teachers were trained and certified.

MEST in accordance with current legislation has accredited several CPD providers, which are included in the catalogue for CPD of teachers and education managers. In this catalogue accredited providers are described in general way, while their accredited programmes are described based on its features: type of programme, provider, duration, beneficiaries, expected results, content and methodology and certification process. All this information is important because of the requirements of the teacher licensing system. The content of the CPD programme creates the possibility for teachers to choose the programme which will help them to improve their performance in the classroom and meet national curriculum implementation requirements.

The survey provides some evidence on how teachers judge the quality of programmes and the results are given in the table below. Teachers were asked to evaluate the impact of different kinds of CPD.

Focus of CPD	% of participating VET teachers (valid responses) reporting medium or high impact
Knowledge and understanding relating to their teaching subject	84
CPD focusing upon curriculum	90
Career guidance and counselling	88
Skills and knowledge relating to the work place	87
Generic skills, e.g. enterprise skills	84
Special needs	77
Multi-cultural learning	88

6.1 Conclusions

Responsibility for the design of CPD programmes belongs to CPD providers while responsibility for the accreditation of CPD programmes and providers belongs to MEST. Until now MEST has accredited 147 CPD programmes but these programmes don't directly reflect real training needs of VET teachers but mostly have been designed to support the implementation of the Kosovo Curriculum Framework. Relatively few programmes have been designed to meet the needs of VET teachers in particular, in most cases these have been designed in partnership with donor agencies.

Despite these issues there is evidence that most VET teachers believe that CPD programmes have medium or high impact. On the other hand, around 16% of VET teachers stated that CPD programmes were of low or no impact suggesting that quality of delivery is inconsistent or that some programmes are inappropriate assigned. There are also issues in the monitoring of the impact of CPD relating to the capability of municipal education directorates and the inspectorate.

In partnership with donors, Kosovo has been able to design some appropriate CPD programmes for VET teachers, which are of high quality. However, measures are needed to bring about the design of CPD which is properly informed by the needs of teachers and schools and which takes account of the volume of need and the practicalities of cost and time.

While there are regulatory mechanisms in place, there is a need for research and development work to create and delivery CPD programmes which are responsive and affordable.

6.2   Issues and recommendations

Main issues	Recommendations
■ CPD programmes required that will meet teachers needs.	■ Where teachers have a need which is not met by existing programmes new CPD programmes should be commissioned or identified.
■ Programmes need to be affordable so that they can be more widely provided.	■ Cost-effective programmes and modes of provision are explored.
■ Processes and capability need to be developed in national agencies so that they can develop appropriate CPD programmes.	■ National and international bodies support agencies involved in CPD research and development.
■ There should be feedback from monitoring so that CPD can be improved as necessary.	■ School evaluation should review CPD explicitly.

7   SCHOOL-BASED PROVISION

All schools including VET schools in Kosovo should prepare school development plans and this includes an annual training needs analysis for staff. Each school is obliged to support school-based activities for CPD according to the annual plan which has been agreed with its municipal education directorate. Schools should offer regular activities for CPD through meetings with teaching staff and prepare documentation and observe procedures of accreditation of school-based CPD in order for this CPD to be recognised in the licensing system. Also, schools must prepare an annual report for their municipality regarding CPD school-based activities.

Documentary evidence suggests that:

■   In the period from 2013 and 2014, 275 school development plans have been developed in 22 municipalities in which individual training plans of teachers have been included.

■   School-based teachers' councils and councils of coordinators for the implementation of the Kosovo Curriculum Framework have been established in 92 pilot schools (of which 10 are VET schools).

■   MEST, USAID/BEP and twining project have organised trainings for 140 schools (there is no evidence how many are VET schools).

■   100 school-based coordinators have been trained.

■   22 development plans for school-based CPD have been developed.

■   Schools have been supplied with CPD programmes, training catalogue and some on-line CPD programmes.

The interviews raise doubts about how well planning, needs analysis and capacity building at school level is working.

Municipal education directorates, in cooperation with schools, present project proposals for CPD to MEST for funding; in case this proposal is chosen by MEST for support, an agreement is signed between MEST and the municipal education directorate. This agreement specifies that activities for CPD can start only once the CPD programme is accredited and recognised by the State Council for Teacher Licensing. MEST, through its Department of Inspection, and the Kosovo Pedagogical Institute monitor CPD activities based on the signed agreement. Based on monitoring and evaluation results MEST plans further support for CPD to the respective municipality. According to interviews there are problems in the way that this process works which make planning difficult and provision uncertain.

There are some pilot initiatives for nine-year schools (primary and lower secondary) through the BEP programme to strengthen school-based CPD. A Framework for school-based CPD has been piloted in 12 schools, covering 9 municipalities and 400 teachers have been trained. If successful these pilot initiatives could be extended to upper secondary education, including VET. To ensure the quality of training courses, the BEP is providing monitoring by certified experts, and written reports have been prepared to identify strengths and weaknesses.

There are no national induction programmes for new teachers in Kosovo. According to the teacher survey, only 32% of VET teachers participated in a formal induction programme and only 23% took part in informal induction activities.

In some schools, however, mentors are appointed to assist new teachers and guide them in their first steps in the new school environment. There continues to be an issue about how such mentors will be compensated. The status of the assigned mentor is not legally defined. However, the quality assurance coordinator does have a reduction of teaching hours and may carry out a mentoring role.

Training for mentoring has been provided by the National Qualification Authority for VET school leaders and training centres management teams, quality assurance coordinators and VET teachers. This took the form of a two-day training for around 150 participants, from public and private VET schools and different accredited training centres from all regions of Kosovo. From the survey results it can be seen that feedback was given by mentors to 13% of VET teachers following observations of classroom teaching. This is still a low percentage, but a sign that there are positive developments.

Peer observations are still not a legal requirement, but some private colleges and VET institutions have already established quality assurance teams and practice peer observation. Nevertheless, there are no legal requirements established for mentoring, except in some cases when an internal regulation of particular institutions requires it.

The survey also provides evidence on the extent to which teachers work collaboratively to solve problems, implement new curricula and plan their teaching.

■ 74% of respondents reported planned discussions with other teachers over the last month.

■ 56.2% with school managers or pedagogic advisors.

■ 57.5% informal discussions with other teachers, managers or pedagogic advisors.

The level of planned collaboration between VET teachers is relatively high and it suggests that there is a collaborative culture in Kosovo's VET schools. Collaboration of this kind might be extended and used to bring about improvements in teaching.

All VET schools have developed school development plans, self-assessment reports and improvement plans. From the results of the interviews it can be concluded that school development plan is a fountain of desires rather than an analysis that identifies the real needs and financial possibilities for the school. From the desk research and interviews there is the impression that school principals, teachers and municipal education directorates sometimes look at CPD purely as matter of meeting licensing requirements rather than meeting the development needs of teachers. In this regard, the planning capacity of all stakeholders should be strengthened. Decisions about CPD should focus on the impact that CPD will have upon teaching and learning.

7.1 Conclusions

There are legal requirements for the school development plan in which an annual training needs analysis for CPD of its staff is given. Schools are obliged to propose school-based activities for CPD according to the annual school development plan, which has been agreed with the municipal education directorate. However, implementation remains an issue, VET schools are supposed to use CPD for systematic improvement of teaching and learning and for innovation in education. The interviews and results of the survey show that these requirements are mainly a kind of formality with the regard to teacher licensing system and requirements of the VET teachers' normative.

There has been investment training for coordinators to support school-based CPD. We need to know more about the factors which support or work against school-based needs analysis, planning and provision of CPD.

Collaboration is well established at school level, however, it appears that about 25% of teachers appear to working alone while over 40% of teachers are not regularly supported by managers or advisors.

Based on the provisions of Administrative Instruction 15/2013 there are mechanisms for monitoring and evaluation of CPD and assessment for the effect in the classroom, however the assessment criteria for teachers performance are limited only at the level of teachers portfolio as one of the conditions for teachers licensing.

7.2 Issues and recommendations

Main issues	Recommendations
■ School-based CPD does not appear to operate fully in many VET schools.	■ Extension of school-based CPD in all schools. ■ Schools to be supported to provide CPD that meets the needs of school and teachers. ■ Budget provision for school-based CPD to be reviewed.
■ No induction programmes for teachers. ■ Mentors are not appointed and their legal status is not resolved. ■ Peer observations are still not a legal requirement.	■ Induction programmes for all new teachers need to be part of school-based CPD activities. ■ Develop clearer expectations and support for mentoring and monitoring teacher professional development activities.
■ Schools need more support to develop effective CPD provision.	■ Creating teacher associations on regional basis for collaboration, cooperation and exchange of best practices and materials. ■ Supporting and developing an on-line in-service training package/platform translated into regional languages and accessible in all countries in the region. ■ Cooperation between VET schools and the Faculty of Education.

8. PROFESSIONAL DEVELOPMENT NEEDS

In Kosovo all schools, including VET schools, are required to prepare school development plans, and based on these plans schools must make annual training needs analysis for CPD for staff. As explained in Chapter 7 above, there is a requirement that schools identify, plan and provide for their professional development needs. This process should operate at national level in a systematic way and with support from the municipalities and the Ministry[10]. According to the survey, 75% of teachers believed that it was mainly their own responsibility to identify their own training needs and to find their own training. Only 62% agreed that there was a well-defined process to assess and meet needs. One strategy would be for more monitoring and assessment of training needs in schools, so that the purpose and value of CPD becomes better understood.

The survey offers some evidence in relation to CPD needs. The table below reports the CPD needs reported by domain and level.

VET TEACHER TRAINING NEEDS BY DOMAIN AND LEVEL (%)

Domain	High level of need	Moderate level of need
Knowledge and understanding in their own subject	8.9	27.9
ICT	25.8	22.9
Knowledge of the curriculum	24.8	33.5
Student evaluation and assessment practices	19.8	27
New technologies in the workplace	32.4	30
Teaching students with special needs	34.9	22.9
Updating my professional knowledge and skills in relation to current practice in the workplace	18.45	33.2
Student career guidance and counselling	24	34.7

However, there is a discrepancy between the teacher education programmes offered and the needs identified in schools.

Standards for teachers' professional practice have been set in Kosovo by Administrative Instruction since 2014. The main goal of these standards is to define criteria for the quality assurance of teaching. In theory, the standards should help define the competences to be developed through initial and continuing professional development. They should help with the identification of needs and the evaluation of professional development programmes. However, three legal documents are still in development: the profile of teachers' competences, the framework for school-based CPD and the assessment criteria for teachers' performance. According to most of the stakeholders interviewed, these documents will complete the legal basis for CPD but stakeholders have concerns about implementation, for some of them this has to do with limited funds, limited human capacities or lack of responsibility or accountability.

---

[10] Anastasovska-Jankulovska, M., Teacher Education and Training in the Western Balkans, 2013

8.1 Conclusions

Formally there are mechanisms for needs identification and school planning with the framework of agreed teacher standards. However, currently the school planning process appears to be formalistic. In many schools training needs are not accurately identified and even where needs are identified it is difficult for schools to obtain CPD provision that matches these needs.

8.2 Issues and recommendations

Main issues	Recommendations
■ Needs identification and CPD planning at school level is not reliable and does not inform CPD provision. School managers are not trained to identify training needs and to organise and support teachers' professional development. ■ Teachers themselves have to identify their own needs and to apply for training.	■ VET school management capacities need to be strengthened for development of school plans and better planning of school CPD activities. ■ The way that teachers themselves participate in assessing their own CPD needs should be reviewed – possibly through assistance from mentors or peers.
■ Municipal education directorates are not able to implement the process of teacher licensing system in terms of budget and development plans.	■ Investigate the barriers to implementation and address problems, e.g. those relating to funding.
■ Although standards for teachers have been designed they are not used to help identify and meet development needs.	■ Experimental use of standards in needs analysis and CPD design followed by critical review.

9. TEACHER FEEDBACK AND REVIEW

Teacher's performance evaluation is regulated on the basis of MEST Administrative Instruction 14/2013, which sets out standards in terms of competencies and indicators such as: commitment to students and their learning, professional knowledge, teaching, cooperation with colleagues, parents and community, CPD and responsibility to tasks and obligations at work. The evaluation of teachers' performance is shared between MEST, represented by Inspection Directorate, school management and teachers. The Municipal Education Directorate provides support and ensures transparency. The process of performance evaluation is completed through four instruments and is weighted as follows:

■ self-assessment by teachers 10%;

■ school director 30%;

■ classroom inspection observation 30%; and

■ whole lesson planning and implementation 30%.

From the interviews it can be concluded that teachers are assessed based on the criteria mentioned above, but the reliability of this process is questioned by stakeholders. This process is linked with CPD so that assessment is supposed to help to identify CPD and meets teachers professional development needs.

The survey shows that the main source of feedback for teachers is from school principals or school managers: 63% of VET teachers received feedback after observation of their teaching. Relatively few teachers received feedback of any kind from external actors, such as inspectors, mentors or other teachers. A significant minority had never received any feedback in their current school (18%) while 40% had never received feedback relating to student surveys.

Teachers reported that feedback impacted upon their positively upon their self-esteem and upon their performance. About 40% of teachers reported that feedback led to a large increase in their sense of job satisfaction and their level of motivation. Over 34% reported that feedback led to a large improvement in their teaching practices and their confidence as teachers.

9.1 Conclusions

The data from the interviews and the data collected from the survey suggest that feedback offers an important tool for supporting teachers and for improving the quality of teaching. VET teachers are benefiting from feedback but there is potential to increase this. Monitoring, observation, inspection, review and feedback need to be provided by school principals, inspectors, quality assurance coordinators, assigned mentors and colleagues. 22% of teachers say that feedback is leading to large changes in the CPD they receive – a key goal should be to increase this linkage.

This data suggests that there is some good practice in relation to provision of feedback. However, there is scope for much greater use of various forms of feedback: mentors are not appointed in VET schools, the status of quality assurance coordinator is not solved in all schools and regions, inspector needs to be more active in observation of teachers performance and teachers are not providing feedback to one another directly or through their professional bodies.

9.2   Issues and recommendations

Main issues	Recommendations
■ Teachers are not benefiting from feedback as much as they could.	■ Monitoring, observation, inspection and peer activities need to be planned better and provided by school principals, inspectors, quality assurance coordinator, assigned mentors and colleagues.
■ Mentors are not appointed in VET schools and the status of quality assurance coordinator is not clear in all schools and regions.	■ Review why mentors are not appointed.
■ Inspectors needs to be more active in observation of teachers' performance.	■ Review of the inspection process to discover what support or guidance is required to improve focus on improving teaching and learning.
■ Feedback is, in most cases, understood and practised as a top down process of accountability.	■ Efforts should be encouraged to recognise that feedback is a form of professional learning and feedback through peers and through professional bodies should be supported.

10. FUNDING

The Law on Education in the Municipalities of Kosovo devolves the professional development of teachers to municipalities. However, the Ministry has not yet taken the step to transfer budgets for CPD to the municipal education directorates and to schools. According to the Law, MEST decides the CPD budget on an annual basis based on the proposals from municipalities for CPD and its own budget framework. Municipalities are required to draft the budget and plan CPD provision according to school demand and teachers' needs. They should delegate the responsibility for the budget and finance to the educational and training institutions, according to the municipal formula specified in the legislation. This formula allows changes in appropriations, if the number of pupils changes during a fiscal year. Municipalities manage and supervise CPD activities at municipal and school level they have to submit a report of activities to the MEST annually.

In practice it is MEST in conjunction with the Ministry of Finance that sets the budget for CPD. There is a single budget line for CPD and teacher licensing and no distinction is made between VET teachers and general teachers at secondary level (CPD for elementary education is separated). Interviews with stakeholders suggest that most of CPD is directly funded by MEST and very little is delegated to municipalities or schools. With respect to CPD for VET teachers this is mostly funded by development partners such as international donors rather than MEST.

In the following table provides data about public expenditure for teacher training for pre-university education sector (government grant, fees and loans). Data presented in this table do not show how much have been spent for VET and how much have been spent for CPD for VET teacher training by development partners.

PUBLIC EXPENDITURE FOR INITIAL TEACHER TRAINING IN PRE-UNIVERSITY EDUCATION SECTOR (EUR)

	Budget spent				Approved
	2011	2012	2013	2014	2015
Teacher training	970 271	847 337	704 062	690 612	728 383

The importance of the contribution made by Development Partners can be seen from the table below. It is also notable that the contribution by Development Partners has declined sharply within budgetary cycle.

DONATIONS FROM DEVELOPMENT PARTNERS 2011–15 (EUR)

	Budget spent – development partners				Approved
	2011	2012	2013	2014	2015
CPD		4 405 912	5 197 956	575 069	174 900
VET	2 454 916	2 470 094	3 792 052	2 575 179	1 158 068

The table below shows the Kosovo Education Strategic Plan 2011–2016 budget plans although it is understood that the outcomes have been different.

PLANNED EXPENDITURE FOR KOSOVO EDUCATION STRATEGIC PLAN 2011–2016 (EUR)

	Development cost	Recurrent cost	Total cost	Annually needed 2016 (recurrent cost)
VET	20 140 950	14 200 360	34 341 310	4 298 350
CPD	2 913 310	7 770 900	10 684 210	1 501 410
Teacher licensing	166 200	2 940 000	3 106 200	687 500
Total for Kosovo Education Strategic Plan	241 890 767	238 534 175	480 424 942	57 681 620
% (CPD + teacher licensing)/total	1.27	4.49	2.87	3.79

It would be of value to analyse the financial outcomes in order to have a better understanding of what has been spent on the different lines.

Teachers also contribute directly to the funding of their own CPD. According to the survey 10.3% of respondents declared that they had to cover all the costs of their own professional development and 32.1% some of the costs. Interviews with stakeholders suggest that such spending could be travelling costs or fees which are related to bachelor and master studies and which teachers had to cover by themselves in order to meet the requirements of teachers normative and teacher licensing system.

10.1 Conclusions

The ministry provides financial resources for CPD based its strategic plan in order to support education reforms such as the implementation of Kosovo Curriculum Framework and to ensure the performance standards are met. However, sustainable budgets to fund teacher professional development and financial mechanisms for its effective implementation remain a challenge in Kosovo. The Ministry continues to manage the in-service training budget without an adequate mechanism that would permit it to serve all teachers who are obliged to take part. Legislative powers to delegate funding decisions to municipalities and to schools have not been implemented. It is questionable whether current funding processes permit the efficiency of spending on CPD to be measured.

10.2 Issues and recommendations

Main issues	Recommendations
■ Budget for CPD of VET teachers is constraining the provision of CPD. ■ Municipal education directorates are not able to obtain financial resources to meet the training plans of schools. ■ School principals do not have information about indicated budget for CPD of their staff.	■ New funding opportunities such as public private partnerships should be explored. ■ Establish an unique budget line CPD for VET teachers at Ministry level. ■ Review the role of municipalities in the funding process.
■ Successful CPD provision requires close collaboration between municipalities, schools and CPD providers.	■ Municipalities together with VET schools and CPD providers should plan the provision of CPD activities.
■ There is a need to obtain value for money.	■ CPD programmes should be planned based on real training needs of teachers in order to increase efficiency. ■ More analysis of planning and spending data in order to distinguish between elements such as CPD for VET and general teachers and the cost of the licensing system.
■ There is a need to increase CPD provision in a sustainable way that is responsive to priority needs.	■ AVETA through its centres of competence should contribute to the provision of CPD activities for VET teachers and instructors as an income generating activity.

11. RECOGNITION AND INCENTIVISATION

Licensing is linked to teacher performance, evaluation and to mechanisms that serve to improve the quality of teaching and learning in classrooms. The Ministry is responsible for a process of pre-registration based on fair and transparent criteria to form an open list of licensed prospective teachers, which is to be updated annually. Accordingly, municipalities may register and employ only those candidates who are included in the list. The CPD for VET teachers is integrated into the licensing system set out in the provisions of Administrative Instruction 25/2014, which specify the requirements for teachers to enter, remain and to be promoted in their profession. The criteria for advancement from temporary to regular license are listed below.

■ Teachers with a temporary licence must obtain 30 hours of 'basic training' and must have positive assessment by the school. A temporary licence is issued for one year.

■ A regular career licence is issued to teachers who are qualified and have at least one year of working experience. The licence of the career teacher must be renewed every five years providing the teacher has shown satisfactory performance and has completed 100 teacher training hours within this period, from which at least 70 training hours were basic training programmes and up to 30 training hours were additional training programmes. If teachers who hold a career licence fail to meet these requirements, they are given one additional year to meet them and if these requirements are not meet, the licence is cancelled.

■ The Advanced Teacher Licence is issued to a teacher who meets requirements for a career licence for five years, has completed 300 teaching hours of CPD during his career (at least 200 training hours from basic training programmes and 100 training hours from additional training programmes) and shows a positive performance level. The Advanced teachers' license is valid for five years and is renewed after evaluation of teacher's performance.

■ The Mentor Teacher Licence is issued to a teacher who meets requirements as a bearer of Advanced licence for last five years, has completed 450 teaching hours of CPD during his career (at least 250 training hours from basic training programmes and 200 training hours from additional training programmes) and shows a positive performance level and is supported by a recommendation made by school principal. The mentor teachers' license is valid for five years and is renewed after evaluation of teachers' performance.

■ The Merit Teacher Licence is issued to a teacher who meets requirements for the Mentor licence for ten years, has completed 650 teaching hours during his career (at least 400 training hours from basic training programmes and 250 training hours from additional training programmes) and shows positive performance level. The Merit Teacher License is permanent.

A license may also be withdrawn or suspended in cases where the performance of a licensed teacher is an issue of concern, a teacher is unable to continue his tasks and responsibilities, or disciplinary proceedings have been instituted. There is a salary increase of 10% extra for each level in the career ladder, thus providing a link between CPD and pay.

On the other hand, 42.9% of respondents agreed that there are no incentives to undertake CPD and 17.5% strongly agreed to that. This suggests that, at this point in time, many VET teachers do not understand or do not appreciate the way that licensing is intended to incentivise CPD. Regarding the question whether CPD is too expensive/unaffordable 36.2% agreed and 8.5% strongly agreed. This response may reflect new requirements that teachers should obtain a licence which means that they have to pay by themselves for the costs of study to obtain a master's degree at university and cover their travel costs and other related expenditure.

Despite the existence of the licensing system 60.4% of VET teachers surveyed reported that there were no incentives for participating in CPD activities and that this was a barrier to participation. A further 47.4% reported that there was no relevant CPD for them. This suggests that the licensing system is failing, so far, to effectively incentivise CPD. In part this is because many teachers cannot access any CPD, despite the licensing requirements, and the CPD which is available does not seem directly relevant to their development needs.

CPD is not offered based on real annual training needs analysis, in some cases there is no transparent process to ensure that CPD for VET teachers is fairly distributed and that the needs of individuals and of schools is taken into account. Although some teachers are not qualified for the subjects they teach, they are not offered relevant training.

11.1 Conclusions

In Kosovo there is a career structure for teachers and a system of licensing which are intended to incentivise and recognise CPD. However, in practice there is limited in-service teacher training capacity; the budget for teacher training and promotion is limited; and municipalities lack the mechanisms and human capacities for quality assessment of the teachers.

11.2 Issues and recommendations

Issues	Recommendations
■ The licensing system is not incentivising CPD because there are not sufficient resources to for all teachers to meet the training hour requirements specified.	■ Explore options for meeting the training deficit: • lower the number of hours expected; • increase the budget; • make better use of the existing budget, e.g. through more school-based CPD.
■ The process by which teachers are assigned training is not consistently based on need.	■ Review the process by which CPD is assigned to individual teachers and to schools.
■ The supply of CPD which does carry a formal qualification is very limited and teachers are expected to pay some of the cost which may be a disincentive for some.	■ Explore how, in the future, more CPD programmes could be recognised through qualifications.

12. TRAINING OF COMPANY-BASED TRAINERS (AND TRAINERS IN TRAINING CENTRES)

To avoid confusion we can distinguish between practical instructors working in vocational schools, trainers working in vocational training centres and trainers working in companies.

Practical instructors working in vocational schools

Based on the Law for VET No 04/L-138, some of the teaching personnel for VET programmes are also instructors/trainers of practical modules. The recent normative for VET teachers specifies criteria that need to be met by instructors or trainers of professional practice. In order to be employed as instructor in VET schools a candidate must have a bachelor's degree in related field, post-secondary education, technical education or similar with at least five years of working experience in enterprise, business and other relevant institutions. However, the current teacher licensing system does not cover instructors of practice and they are not part of the licensing system although they may qualify as teachers and gain a licence.

Trainers working in vocational training centres

Within the Ministry of Labour and Social Welfare is the Vocational Training Division, which is responsible for managing the public vocational training network in Kosovo, comprising eight vocational training centres and six mobile training centres. They have workshops providing training in 30 occupations and about 80 full time staff. The network of vocational training centres has about a decade of experience in training (mostly young people) and is a vehicle for regeneration and development of local communities. In all relevant strategies and policies the ministry has stated that support is needed for upgrading the professional skills of trainers, development of curricula, assessment instruments, internal and external quality assurance systems, etc.[11].

Even though they are not part of the licensing system that SCTL is providing, the majority of the trainers and instructors working in public training centres are trained in the accredited programmes that are part of the teacher licensing system. Also, a large number of them are trained and certified by national and international agencies in their respective field.

Trainers working in companies and public companies

Large government departments, public and private companies do have their own arrangements for training their trainers. There are some good examples of cooperation between MEST and these public and private organisations, where they have shared different training sessions for new methodologies and techniques of teaching training, for professional didactics, assessment, for development of occupational standards, development of curricula and for preparing different strategic documents and policies. For example, the training centre of Kosovo Electrical Corporation (KEK), which is a public company, has three programmes accredited by MEST (technical trainings, non-technical trainings, job safety) to provide trainings not only for its staff but also for VET students and teachers.

In July 2015 a Memorandum of Understanding was agreed between MEST and the Company for Electrical Distribution (KEDS) to send a number of VET students from schools and public universities for professional practice in real working conditions. KEDS' trainers are trained in didactics, pedagogy and assessment and they will evaluate these students using tests which will be prepared in close cooperation with the VET school teachers. This is a very good example of cooperation and sharing experiences between VET schools and the business sector.

---

[11] Ministry of Labour and Social Welfare, Vocational Training Strategy 2012–2014, 2011

Another example is the Centre of Competence of Ferizaj, where business is located in school premises and where there is mutual benefit for school and business. In this case, VET students are working in real working conditions, for the school there is no need to spend money for raw materials and for VET teachers there is a chance to update their knowledge of practice and technology. As mentioned in Chapter 8 above, VET teachers expressed a high level of need for this kind of CPD.

Another, example of cooperation of different stakeholders is where the MEST division for Adult Education in cooperation with DVV International, the Ministry of Labour, and University of Prishtina prepared and provided trainings for 57 trainers working for the regional training centres of the Ministry of Labour and Social Welfare. An important element in this regard is the curriculum for global adult learning and education (Curriculum Global) which is translated into Albanian and has been provided to all providers of adult education. The project includes the translation, printing and distribution of an andragogic manual for educators implemented in cooperation with DVV International and with the support of GIZ and the Swiss Agency for Development and Cooperation.

12.1 Conclusions

The results of the interviews and the survey indicate that further cooperation between MEST, public and private providers and businesses is needed although some good examples of this are already taking place. The results of the survey show that many teachers expressed a high level of need (32.4%) or moderate level of need (30.2%) for CPD addressing new technologies in the workplace.

12.2 Issues and recommendations

Main issues	Recommendations
■ There is no licensing of instructors of professional practice working in schools. ■ There is some support for training of trainers working in vocational training centres through funding organisations and development partners. ■ There are some good partnerships between publicly owned companies and educational institutions. ■ There is very little collective funding of training in the private sector.	■ Procedures for licensing of trainers and instructors of the practice should be developed and implemented. ■ Competency standards should be developed for trainers or instructors of the practice for different profiles. ■ Funding sources to support training of trainers working in the private sector should be explored. ■ More partnerships between public and private organisations to support the training of trainers are needed. ■ Successful initiatives of cooperation between different institutions and providers should be extended or replicated.

13. CONCLUSIONS AND RECOMMENDATIONS

The analysis from the literature review and interviews shows that Kosovo is well-advanced in terms of legislation and other policy documents related to CPD. The analysis of the Kosovo Education Strategic Plan 2011–2016, with respect to VET and adult education and teachers training, demonstrate achievements (e.g. 43% of VET teachers received at least two hours of CPD over the last 12 months) but still there is a lot to be done and the targets of the Kosovo Education Strategic Plan in this regard now seem ambitious. Problems in implementation can be explained by lack of resources or failure to effectively manage resources, limited capacity of national and local institutions to design, provide and manage CPD and issues relating to governance and accountability.

The main issues and challenges identified in this analysis should be addressed in the Kosovo Education Strategic Plan 2017–2022. All stakeholders, including MEST, should recognise VET teachers as category of teachers with specific CPD needs, this means that CPD of VET teachers should be developed separately within the comprehensive system of CPD. This state of affairs also has implications for VET teachers' initial education and for the legal requirements relating to the normative for VET teachers.

A key issue that needs to be addressed concerns the responsibilities of different bodies that have a stake in CPD of VET teachers. At the national level there is a need to enhance the contribution of the VET Centre, the Kosovo Pedagogical Institute, the University of Prishtina and businesses. At a local level, the role of the municipalities in finance and planning of CPD and quality assurance of CPD needs support. There is evidence that the municipalities lack capacity and expertise and that collaboration with VET schools is not working well. VET schools also need support to carry out their responsibilities to identify training needs and to plan and assign CPD.

The findings indicate that currently CPD provision is not sufficient in volume to meet the requirements set by the licensing process for VET teachers. The licensing system does encourage the take up of CPD but CPD provision is not well-targeted. The design of CPD is not informed by teachers' current needs and CPD is not assigned to teachers on the basis of their individual development needs. Schools are not able to plan CPD so that it addresses the priorities of their teachers or school development. The planning and impact of CPD are not effectively evaluated.

The report found that there has been some high quality provision of CPD targeted at VET teachers in Kosovo which has met the needs of VET teachers and has had high impact, for example, CPD programmes addressing curriculum knowledge, current industrial practice and ICT skills were judged of high impact by more than 40% of participants. There are some good partnerships between public and private sector companies and the education and training sector which have made possible professional development for both partners. In general, however, there is a need to develop the capacity of national and local organisations to work together to generate appropriate and sustainable CPD.

Overall the system should encourage the development and delivery of specialised CPD to meet the needs of VET teachers and trainers. There is a need to increase the overall volume of CPD for VET teachers, which implies that additional funding for CPD is desirable. Nevertheless, there are opportunities to explore whether better use could be made of existing resources and whether some relatively inexpensive actions, such as improved support for needs identification, might lead to more effective CPD provision.

Furthermore, there is a need to review the role of municipalities in the funding of CPD and also to consider how more analysis of planning and financial outcomes might contribute to greater efficiency. In addition, some of the following recommendations explore how additional provision might be generated through public-private partnerships, through more market-based and school-based provision. Further recommendations provided by the MEST's Teacher Training Division are presented in Annex C.

Recommendations

At the level of national policy making, planning and regulation, appropriate authorities and agencies should cooperate to:

1.   review the implications for CPD provision created by the licensing system and by the requirement that VET teachers obtain a master's degree;

2.   put in place, through Kosovo Education Strategic Plan 2017–2022, affordable plans to meet realistic targets;

3.   ensure that VET Teachers receive additional payment as envisaged by the licensing system, in order to incentivise and recognise career structure;

4.   place greater emphasis on the observation of teacher performance, through internal and external quality assurance processes, in order to identify needs for professional development and evaluate its impact. Support might take the form of guidance or capacity building for inspectors and principals;

5.   find ways to support the capacity of municipal education directorates to manage the funding of CPD, to plan provision and to coordinate the work of teacher training providers;

6.   develop a process and offer support to identify professional development needs in schools (which may include an enhanced role for teachers to help to identify their own needs) and to plan CPD provision for schools;

7.   appoint coordinators for CPD and mentors in all VET schools;

8.   put in place a system to collect and organise data to make it possible to track the progress of VET teachers through the licensing process and the through the career ladder and to understand their professional development needs and record their CPD.

With respect to CPD provision, CPD providers, VET schools and local authorities should cooperate to ensure that:

9.   there is an increase in the number of places on master programmes for VET teachers at the Faculty of Education at the University of Pristina to accelerate progress towards meeting the requirements of VET teachers normative 05/2015;

10.   the capacity of in-service teacher training providers increases (or is supplemented by new providers) to provide appropriate CPD to all VET teachers and enable them to meet legal requirements of the licensing system and to improve their teaching;

11.   there is support for school-based CPD which is tailored to needs and cost-effective, for example, induction, mentoring, peer review;

12.   there is CPD provision which addresses the needs of practical instructors.

The MEST Teacher Training Division, the VET Council, the VET Centre, VET schools and wider stakeholders should:

13. establish, publish and update the catalogue of programmes for CPD on annual basis; provision relevant to VET teachers should be clearly identified;

14. encourage the use of existing competency standards to inform the design of CPD programmes and the identification of CPD needs;

15. extend mentoring, observation, inspection and peer review activities focusing upon teaching with a view to giving productive feedback and informing CPD and other support for teachers;

16. provide support for school-based procedures along with external procedures for evaluating and identifying teacher training needs on the school level;

17. enhance the capacities of the Kosovo Institute of Pedagogy and the Institute for Teacher Development to contribute to research, development and evaluation of CPD for VET teachers and trainers;

18. develop standards and CPD for trainers or instructors of the practice;

19. review the timetable and requirements for licensing and career structure along with the allocation process for CPD to ensure that these mechanisms do support appropriate and worthwhile CPD;

20. give consideration to establishing a system for credit recognition and certification of CPD programmes offered by development partners in cooperation with MEST. This mechanism might complement or supplement the master programme offered by the University of Pristina;

21. give consideration to extending credit recognition to other kinds of CPD, for example, school-based learning.

With respect to funding responsible authorities and stakeholders should cooperate to:

22. clearly identify the budget available for municipalities to commit to CDP and provide guidance on the use of these resources;

23. ensure that decisions about the allocation of funds to provide CPD at national and local level should be informed by an understanding of training needs, training costs and value for money;

24. ensure that VET schools have the opportunity to inform the use of training funds so that they can select the provision which best fits their needs;

25. encourage VET Schools, training providers (including donors), municipalities and central agencies to work together to obtain the best value from resources;

26. explore new funding opportunities for CPD such as public-private partnerships, school provision and new international opportunities.

Ministries and national agencies, VET schools, businesses and their representatives should work together to:

27. support dialogue and research to understand the training needs of trainers working in the private sector;

28. support and construct partnerships between VET schools/training centres and companies (private and public sector) to support collaboration and shared training and professional development;

29. develop competency standards for trainers based in companies;

30. help VET teachers and practical instructors to update their knowledge of current working practices in industry through direct contact with industry.

At the level of institutional responsibilities and governance,

31. appropriate authorities and agencies should cooperate to clarify the roles and functions of the various agencies and institutions that contribute to CPD development and validation of CPD programmes and the accreditation of providers for VET CPD[12];

32. MEST, the Ministry of Finance and other relevant stakeholders should revise current legislation to facilitate cooperation between public and private institutions for the provision of CPD;

33. the Council for Vocational Education and Training should engage stakeholders and play an active role in the strategic planning of CPD for VET teachers;

34. AVETAE should play a role in designing and implementation CPD programmes for VET teachers and instructors and advise MEST in revising policies for the VET teacher licensing system;

35. VET teacher associations should be developed to support collaboration and learning among VET teachers.

---

[12] Article 25 of VET Law: 'Programmes for qualification and re-qualification for director, deputy director and teaching personnel in institutions that provide programmes of vocational education and training, shall be validated and accredited by the NQA according to CVETA [Council for Vocational Education and Adults' Training] advices.'

REFERENCES

Administrative Order 05/2014 on Agency for Vocational Education and Training and Adults' Training (AVETAE) in Kosova

Anastasovska-Jankulovska, M. (2013), Teacher education and training in the Western Balkans

ASK, 2014, Statistical yearbook of the Republic of Kosovo 2014

ASK, 2013, Education statistics, 2012–13

Beka, A., 2013, Ndryshimet e pjesshme apo reformimi teresor i sistemit (Sfidat e Sistemit arsimor ne Kosove), PhD thesis, Tirane, 2014

Berisha V. and Ilazi B., 2013, STIKK, ICT skills gap analysis

Bicaj, A. and Berisha, F., 2013, Teacher preparation reform in Kosovo, JECS pp. 199–209,

Catalogue of accredited programmes for professional development for teachers and education administrators, 2011, EU Education SWAp project, Pristina

ETF (European Training Foundation, 2011, ETF yearbook 2011: Social partners in vocational education and training

ETF-Kosovo Pedagogical Institute, 2014, Torino Process 2014: Kosovo

EU Kosvet, V, 2011, Aligning Kosovo's education and training system with NQF and ISCED levels

EU Kosvet, V, 2011, Guide to moving forward with external evaluation of VET in Kosovo

EU Kosvet, V, 2011, Report on proposals and recommendations for level 5 qualifications

European Commission, 2014, Kosovo progress report

Eurostat, 2012, Key data on education in Europe 2012

Eurostat and Unicef database, 2014

Kadrijaj, V., 2011, Human capacity building for elementary school teachers, Report for GIZ

KEC (Kosovo Education Centre), 2014, Raporti i punes 2012–2013

Kirsh, M. and Bernaert, Y., 2011, SCHE: Level 5 missing link

Kita, L., ETF, 2009, Review of humans resourses development: Kosovo

KOG, 2014, Draft skills Kosovo 2020

Law No 03/L-018, Law on Final exam and State Matura for Kosovo

Law No 04/L-138 for Vocational education and training

Law No 04/L-143 on Adults education and training in the Republic of Kosovo

Law No 04/L-032 on Pre-university education in the Republic of Kosovo

Likaj, R., 2008, SSD report for ETF

MEF, Statistics 2002–2014

MES, 2012, National Strategy for VET and lifelong learning 2013–2017

MEST (Ministry of Labour and Social Welfare), 2010, Kosovo Education Strategic Plan 2011–2016

MEST, Aide-Memoire from Joint Annual Review 2013, 2014, Kosovo Education Strategic Plan 2011–2016

MEST, 2008 Law No 03/L-060

MEST, 2013, Strategy for improving practical training 2013–2020

MEST, 2013, VET Law No 04/L-138

MLSW, 2011, Vocational Training Strategy 2012–2014

MLSW, 2012, Labour and employment, Annual report

MLSW, 2013, Labour and employment, Annual report

Mula, M., 2010, Report for teacher development, EU Education SWAp project, Kosovo

NQA (National Qualification Authority), 2014, Referencing report of Kosovo NQF for general education, VET and higher education to European Qualifications Framework

OECD, 2013, Assessment of the Kosovo Innovation System

Report by the international peer review team: Employability in Kosovo, ESOK 2003

Rraci, V., 2013, Career guidance, development trends in Kosovo, Enhancing Youth Employment Project

SAK, Labour Force Survey, 2012

SAK, Labour Force Survey, 2013

Saqipi, B. and Mula, M., 2010, Teacher education in Kosovo

Serhati and Gashi, 2013, ETF mapping of VET educational policies and practices for social inclusion and social cohesion: Kosovo

Thomson Reuters/Ecown/Eurostat

Tzako, P. and Likaj, R., 2009, Framework on SBVET

van Meel, R., ETF, 2012, Education and business study: Kosovo

World Bank, 2014, Public finance review

Legislation in place

- Law No 04/L-138-2013 on Vocational education and training
- Law No 04/L-143-2012 on Adults education and training
- Law No 04/L-032-2011 on Pre-university education
- Law No 03/L-018-2008 on Final examination and State Matura examination
- Law No03/L-068-2008 on Education in the municipalities of Kosovo
- Law No 02/L-52-2006 on Pre-school education
- Law No 2004/37-2004 on Inspection of education in Kosovo

Administrative instructions

- Administrative Instruction 05/2015 on Normative of VET teachers
- Administrative Instruction 06/2015 on Normative of general education teachers
- Administrative Instruction 07/2014 on Advancement, autonomy and functioning of VET institutions (IVET)
- Administrative Instruction 05/2014 on Agency for Vocational Education and Training and Adults' Training (AVETAE) in Kosova
- Administrative Instruction 25/2014 for Teacher licensing
- Administrative Instruction 04/2014 on Conditions and criteria for economic activity of VET institutions (IVET)
- Administrative Instruction 02/2014 on the Number of students with modules and VET qualifications, resources, infrastructure, education, student safety
- Administrative Instruction 01/2014 on Organisation and planning of the educational process in vocational education and training
- Administrative Instruction 14/2013 on Teacher performance evaluation
- Administrative Instruction 15/2013 for Funding of teacher professional development
- Administrative Instruction 16/2013 on Implementation of teacher professional development
- Administrative Instruction 15/2013 on Funding of teacher professional development

- Administrative Instruction 17/2013 on Exams and assessments

- Administrative Instruction 18/2013 on the Use of individual education plans

- Administrative Instruction 23/2013 on Resource centres

- Administrative Instruction 27/2013 on Extracurricular activities

- Administrative Instruction 20/2013 on Piloting of Curriculum Framework and core curriculum

- Administrative Instruction 11/2012 on Criteria for licensing of private educational institutions for primary level; low secondary and high secondary and vocational education

- Administrative Instruction 06/2011 on Licensing and registration of private pre-school educational institutional

- Administrative Instruction 05/2010 on Licensing of teachers

- Administrative Instruction 04/2010 on Criteria and procedures for accreditation of programmes for professional teacher development.

- Administrative Instruction 18/2004 on Licensing the teachers and education administrators

ACRONYMS

AVETAE   Agency for Vocational Education and Training and Adult Education

BEP   Basic Education Programme (funded by USAID)

ECDL   European Computer Driving Licence

ETF   European Training Foundation

EU   European Union

GIZ   Deutsche Gesellschaft für Internationale Zusammenarbeit (formerly GTZ)

ISCED   International Standard Classification of Education

KEK   Kosovo Electrical Corporation

MEST   Ministry of Education, Science and Technology

NGO   Non-governmental organisation

NQA   National Qualification Authority

USAID   United States Agency for International Development

VET   Vocational education and training